

Allama Iqbal in between Eastern and Western Socio-Political Ideologies; Implication on Afghanistan, Azerbaijan, Iran and Pakistan within the Context of Inclusive Accomodativism

Dr. Muhammad Asim (Corresponding Author)

Project Initiator & Head, Assistant Professor of Political Science at Government Graduate College Asghar Mall, Rawalpindi, and Honorary Vice-President at Pak-Iran Intellectuals Forum (Islamabad Office)
asimsheikh62@yahoo.com

Dr. Muhammad Akram Zaheer

Project Team Member, Lecturer in International Relations at Informatics Group of Colleges Arifwala, Pakpattan

Dr. Ghulam Asghar

Project Team Member, Assistant Professor of Urdu at the Islamia University of Bahawalpur

Publication History:

Received: November 09, 2022

Accepted: November 22, 2022

Published Online: January 01, 2023

Keywords:

Paul Collier,
Lenin,
Malinda Panha,
Pamiri Ethnic Community,
Afghan Baqi Kohsar Baqi,
Religious Society of Friends,

Research related to Academic Areas:

Iqbal Studies, Asian Studies,
Political Thoughts and
Ideologies

Acknowledgment:

This is a joint academic project where **Author 01** headed and supervised while **Author 02** and **Author 03** were participated in their full capacity.

Ethical Consideration:

This study has no aim to hurt any ideological or social segment but purely based on academic purposes.

Abstract

Scholarly work of Allama Iqbal has been translated in different European and Asian languages just because of exhibiting inspirations for numerous Eastern and Western socio-political ideologies in his poetry and other literary work. At one side, scholars trace that the dream of establishing a Muslim country in the subcontinent on the basis of Third Positionism has actually been extracted from initial phases of Nazism and Fascism; flourishing in Europe at the time when he was living in Germany. Similarly, on the other side, many of the ideas contained in his books, "The Reconstruction of Religious Thoughts in Islam", "Israr-e-Khudi" and "Rumuz-e-Bekhudi" are thought to be derived from Hinduism and Buddhism, and reconciled with Islam. At the same time, when Iqbal declares Tehran as the "Geneva of the East", he also assumes Afghanistan as a symbol of brevity and 'Center of Globalization' under Jamal-ud-Din Afghani's Pan-Islamism. Therefore, the prime aim of this study is to explore Iqbal's actual stance in between socio-political ideologies that have been evolved in Germany, Italy, Iran, Afghanistan, Saudi Arabia, Turkey and Russia (or USSR) along with Indo-Pak subcontinent, Kashmir and Badakhshan/Pamir Mountain Range. As some of the political economists and third positionists claim similarities among the thoughts of Iqbal and Paul Collier; correlation of Iqbal's scholarly work with other socio-political ideologies in East and the West encourages this study to investigate his academic position between "Inclusivism" and "Accomodativism", modeled as "Inclusive Accomodativism". Moreover, findings and suggestions for socio-political, cultural and economic implication of Inclusive Accomodativism (especially on Afghanistan, Iran, Pakistan and Azerbaijan) during 21st century are given in the last.

Copyright © 2023 IMSTS Journal as an academic research-oriented non-profit initiative of Rehmat and Maryam Researches (SMC-Pvt) Limited, working in Islamabad, Rawalpindi, and Lodhran under the Security and Exchange Commission of Pakistan (SECP). This is an open-access article. However, its distribution and/or reproduction in any medium is subject to the proper citation of the original work.

Introduction

There is significant consensus among social sciences academia within the Pakistan that Allama Iqbal is not only the ideological founder of respective Islamic Republic but he has contributed for the wellbeing of Muslims with both; by poetry and by politics. However, the one of the primary aims of this study is to investigate whether his Allahabad address was based upon personal idea or dream, or it was the exhibition of inspirations from any other ideology. As third positionists¹ or 'Third Position School of Political Economy' does not find any difference between early third positionists' viewpoints and Iqbal's desire for establishing Muslim state in subcontinent, they claim that Iqbal's conversion from territorial-based nationalism to religion-based nationalism was actually his inspirations from early Nazism² and Fascism³

¹ Third Positionists' view or Third Position School of Political Economy seems to be closed with the Mixed School of Political Economy but the difference is, it finds the political ideas in between the reactionary right-wing cultural views and radical left-wing economic views. In fact, Third Positionists like Chip Berlet (1990), Roger Griffin (1995) and Kevin Coogan (1999) often try to achieve the goal of separation or segregation regarding preservation of their cultural differences and protection of domestic economy on the base of ethnicity and race. Therefore, they support ethno-national separatism and ethno-national movements in the developing countries. However, Robert J. Antonio discussed Third Positionism as a Post-Modern phenomenon. According to him, to demand socio-political and economic control over the resources on the base of ethnicity or race can also be called reactionary tribalism where reaction of any tribe against state-centric elements is constructed or triggered by tribal leaders or any third party (for example, proxy agents of private war economies) (Asim M. , 2020).

Generally, this study extracts some major philosophical principles of this school from the works of Chip Berlet, Roger Griffin, Kevin Coogan, Robert J. Antonio and Paul Collier as follows;

- Native ethnic or racial group should lead the domestic economics.
- State or local autonomist government under major native ethnic or racial group should supervise all the economic activities under certain rules and regulations.
- There should be free trade under some sort of protectionist policies imposed by the state or local autonomist government.
- Each individual (whether belong to any ethnic or racial group) in a state and each region of the state (without considering any demographic ratio) should have equal opportunities for economic development.
- State or local autonomist government should control over-charging, less-measuring and low quality in basic necessities of life. There should also be state/local autonomist government-run enterprises for official provision of general public goods.
- State or local autonomist government must discourage economic inequality in between all the segments of society under its jurisdiction.
- State or local autonomist government should get economic independence and self-sufficiency as a legitimate objective to pursue.
- Private property is fully allowed without any ethnic or racial discrimination. State has no right to intervene in private ownership until violation of any law (Asim M. , 2020).

² Usually Nazism is considered as the policies of Adolf Hitler and Nazi Party, but roots of emerging Nazism have been traced back to 1905 to 1920 where anti-Semitism was strengthening because of influential role of Jews in German economy. During this period of time, numerous German leaders raised anti-capitalism and radical antisemitism slogans where Paul de Lagarde declared the Jews as "Bacillus, the carriers of decay who pollute every national culture and destroy all faiths with their materialistic liberalism". Later on, consequences of World War I triggered such sentiments, and led formation of Nazi Party (officially called National Socialist German Workers' Party) on February 24, 1920 (Merkl, 2014, p. 62).

³ Like Nazism, roots of Fascism have also been traced in 1908 when Filippo Tommaso Marinetti founded "Manifesto of Futurism" (1908), by which, he supported modernism and political violence as a necessary ingredients of politics against pro-capitalist liberalism and parliamentary politics. Likewise, essay of Mussolini entitled as "Philosophy of

during his stay in Germany⁴. In other words, they argue that Iqbal replaced the post-World War I German and Italian broader socio-cultural, lingual and biologically inherited concept of nationalist identity with broader religious identity (sometimes called Pan-Islamism) (Asghar, 2019). Similarly, described socio-political and economic disciplines for the nationals within their territorial jurisdictions by either Hitler or Mussolini (in Germany and Italy respectively⁵) coerced Iqbal to present an idea of separate homeland for British Indian Muslims where they would practice their Islamic-disciplined national life (Asghar, 2019).

Similarly, if Iqbal's "The Reconstruction of Religious Thoughts in Islam", "Israr-e-Khudi" and "Rumuz-e-Bekhudi" facilitated the scholars to trace some of ideological lines extracted from Hinduism or Buddhism, and reconciled with Islam⁶; his significant poetic work also indicate his regional familiarizations, associations and acclimatization, such as;

- 1) "Rumi Badley, Shami Badley, Badla Hindustan⁷", "Taleem-o-Tarbiat⁸" and "Jamiat Aqwam-e-Mashriq⁹" in Zarb-e-Kaleem

Strength" has also been published in 1908 where he exhibited his evolving ideology as "A new kind of free spirit will come, strengthened by the war, a spirit equipped with a kind of sublime perversity, a new free spirit will triumph over God and over nothing". Later on, impacts of World War I stimulated respective ideological sentiments that encouraged Benito Mussolini to establish National Fascist Party in Italy on November 09, 1921 (Eveleth, 2019).

⁴ Iqbal moved to Germany in 1907 where he earned PhD degree entitled as "The Development of Metaphysics in Persia" from the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich in 1908 (Hashmi, 2015).

⁵ After World War I, Hitler chanted certain slogans aimed at reviving the German nation. Some of famous slogans were "We are the Germans", "We are the superiors" and "We have to take revenge". By fascinating German nation through receptive slogans, he as a popular leader, boosted the Pan-Germanism across the globe, contextualized that 'Germans (either by race, language or region) are one nation even they live in different countries. However, there should be a powerful state of Germany that could protect their rights and lives across the globe'. Similar perspective was portrayed by Benito Mussolini in Italy during same period of time (Asim M. , 2020).

⁶ By delve deep into Iqbal's thoughts demonstrated in "The Reconstruction of Religious Thoughts in Islam" "Israr-e-Khudi" and "Rumuz-e-Bekhudi", it has been investigated that the concepts about attention, wisdom, perception, volition, consciousness, transmigration and rebirth, soul, doing evil knowingly and unknowingly, dilemmas, inference, asceticism and similes as given in respective books are the reconciled effort with the regionally introduced Buddhist classical book "Malinda Panha", Hinduism's "Ahamkara" and "Kashmir Shaivism" (a nondualist tradition of Shaiva-Shakta Tantra that left huge influence on Hinduism) (Habib, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

In fact, being a Kashmiri (by race) settled in Sialkot, Iqbal has read all the 17 conversations between Menander (king of Indo-Greek Kingdom of Yavanas) and Buddhist monk Nagasena – held in Sagala (capital of Yavanas, old name of Sialkot) and Kishtwar (Kashmir) – presented in the "Malinda Panha". Similarly, he was also aware from the philosophy of Ahamkara (one of the four parts of Antahkarana) presented in Vedanta (one of the six schools in Hinduism). At the same time, his philosophy has also reconciled efforts with the major exponents of Kashmir Shaivism (describe as Pratyabhijna or Recognition) (Habib, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁷ The poem "Badley, Shami Badley, Badla Hindustan" delineates Iqbal's thought in which he gives them rise that Afghans that Romans, Syrians and Indians have been changed. As you are the brave (son of hills), discern yourself and sharp your self-enhancement. O Afghans, take care of you. He further says that you have almost each natural resource including fertile land, plain fields and rivers. So, recognize your wealth (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁸ Verses in this poem evaluate ethical and intellectual downfall of the people (usually consider as Pamiri ethnic community) in Badakhshan Region (currently containing Afghan province of Badakhshan, Gorno-Badakhshan region of Tajikistan, Chitral Districts along with Diamer and Gilgit Divisions in Pakistan, and Tashkurgan Tajik autonomous county of Xinjiang in China) (Rekhta, 2022) (Roofi & Asim, 2017).

⁹ Various scholars take this poem as the pro-Iran stance of Iqbal where he idealizes Iran as the "Geneva of the East"; having ability to lead the Eastern nations (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

- 2) "Nadir Shah Afghan¹⁰", "Tatari Ka Khawab¹¹" and "Khushal Khan ki Wasiyat¹²" in Baal-e-Jibrail
- 3) "Hikayat-e-Sultan Murad-o-Ma'maar¹³" in Rumuz-e-Bekhud
- 4) "Khitab ba-Englistan¹⁴", "Al-Mulkillah¹⁵", "Kashmir¹⁶", "Ghani Kashmiri¹⁷", "Na Afghanyam wa na Turkeyam wan a Tataryam¹⁸" and "Sikandar Raft wa Shamsheer-o-ilm Raft¹⁹" in Peyam-e-Mashriq
- 5) "Dar Fan-e-Tameer Mardan Azad²⁰" and "Zamzama-e-Anjum²¹" in Zabur-e-Ajam
- 6) "Peyam-e-Afghani ba Millat-e-Russia²²", "Deen wa Millat²³", "Namoodar Shudan Darvesh Sudani²⁴", "Roohe-e-Hindustan Nala-o-Faryad mi kunid²⁵", "Arvah Razeela keh ba Mulk-o-milat

¹⁰ By praising rule of King Nadir Shah Afghan (during 1929 to 1933), Iqbal admires not only his governance but encourage Afghans to be brave and enlighten like him (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

¹¹ As wine industry in Tatarstan during Tsar Russia or Soviet rule was growing, Iqbal advises Tatar Muslims to be re-energize and ready for revolution against non-believers. Otherwise, you will face what people of Samarkand have experienced when they leave the lessons and advises of Amir Timur (A Turco-Mongol conqueror, born in Uzbekistan) (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

¹² By motivating Pashtun tribes around Durand Line, Iqbal, in this poem, advises Afghans (seems to advising only Pashtun tribes) to be united (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

¹³ This poem favors Ottomanism (also called Ottoman rule or governance under Ottoman Empire) (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

¹⁴ This composition of verses is the comparative analysis between Eastern and Western tendencies towards development. Iqbal argues that West uses consciousness for formulizing new ways of development whereas; Eastern people look only at their fate for seeking fulfillment of their needs. In fact, Iqbal argues that how Eastern nations can be developed if they will not be justified for their acts and belief (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

¹⁵ By discussing Umayyad occupation of Spain, this poem reflects Iqbal's concept of centralized globalization within the context of Islam where he quotes statement of Tariq Bin Zeyad as "Every country is out country, because each one belongs to our God" (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

¹⁶ Here in, Iqbal praises his homeland and advises to explore beautiful natural views in Kashmir (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

¹⁷ The aforementioned poem praises Ghani Kashmiri (a well-renowned poet), but actual aim of Iqbal behind this writing is to portray Kashmiri orientalism and culture (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

¹⁸ Scholars find this poem as an appropriate reflection for Iqbal's concept of centralized globalization within the context of Islam. Here, he says that no one should call himself as Afghan, Turk or Tatar but only Muslim (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

¹⁹ As nations remain but kings or rulers change, Iqbal refers out Alexander the Great of Macedonia and King Jamshid of Persia who have been gone but nations are still surviving (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

²⁰ For understanding Indo-Persian orientalism, here he comprehensively elaborates archeological developments during Qutb-ud-Din Aibak and Sher Shah Suri rules in Indo-Pak subcontinent (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

²¹ These metrical composition express Iqbal's worries about entire Muslim world including Muslims of Syria, Iraq, Iran and Indo-Pak subcontinent have become lazy; having no curiosity for development, success and progress (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

²² These verses of Iqbal portrays Jamal-ud-Din Afghani's message to Russian nation; advising Russians to come close with Eastern nations and restore his glorified past as once Muslims had. Iqbal says that if Russians seek new style of governance, they should follow Islamic traits; otherwise, Russians will loss whatever Muslims have been lost (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

²³ By exemplifying European concepts of globalization and nationalism, Iqbal emphasizes to Syrian, Palestinian and Iraqi Muslims for leaving ethno-national separatisms but to seek unity and centralized governance as once under Ottoman Empire (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

²⁴ By discouraging ethno-national separatisms in Egypt, Iraq and Saudi Arab, here Iqbal advises them to be united as one nation as once they were under Ottoman Empire (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

²⁵ The prime aim of this piece of verses is to highlight glorious history of Muslims in Indo-Pak subcontinent that have now been absent from Muslims life (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

Gadari kardah²⁶”, “Qasr-e-Sharf-un-Nissa²⁷”, “Zeyarat Hazrat Syed Ali Hamdani wa Mulla Tahir Ghani Kashmiri²⁸” and “Dar-e-Hazoor Shah-e-Hamadan²⁹”, in Javed Nama

- 7) “Bar Mazar-e-Hazrat Ahmad Shah³⁰”, “Kandahar wa Zeyarat Kharqa Mubarak³¹”, “Safar ba Gazni wa Zeyarat Mazar Hakeem Sanai³²”, “Bar Mazar Shehensha Babar Khuld Ashnayi³³” and “Pas cheh bayed kard ae Aqwam-e-Sharq³⁴” in Pas Cheh Bayed Kard
- 8) “Boorhe Baloch ki Naseehat Bete ko³⁵” in Armaghan-e-Hejaz

Similarly, some of his poetic work gives touch of socio-political ideologies, such as;

- 1) “Karl Marx ki Awaz³⁶” in Zarb-e-Kaleem
- 2) “Napoleon ke Mazar Par³⁷”, “Mussolini³⁸” and “Lenin, Khuda ke Hazoor Main³⁹” in Baal-e-Jibrail

²⁶ This is the motivational poem for Muslims of Indo-Pak subcontinent where Iqbal criticizes Jafar of Bengal and Sadiq of Deccan as the major reason of Muslims downfall (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

²⁷ Iqbal presents historical culture and orientalism of Punjab in these verselet lines (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

²⁸ By this lyricism, Iqbal not only highlight intellectualism in Kashmir but declare this region as the “small Iran” or Iran-e-Sageer because of deep and rare literature (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

²⁹ Iqbal writes this poem for urging Kashmiri people regarding regaining their socio-political strength, intellectualism and brevity (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

³⁰ Iqbal Admires Ahmad Shah Abdali as the founder of Afghan nation in the poem “Bar Mazar-e-Hazrat Ahmad Shah (Rekhta, 2022) (Asghar, 2019).

³¹ With praising culture and natural beauty of Kandahar, Iqbal idealizes Afghan soil in this poem (Rekhta, 2022) (Asghar, 2019).

³² Similarly, this poem also indicates Iqbal’s idealization for Afghan soil. By discussing travel to Ghazni, he tries to present glorified history of Afghanistan (Rekhta, 2022) (Asghar, 2019).

³³ Here in “Bar Mazar Shehensha Babar Khuld Ashnay” Iqbal again idealizing Kabul over Delhi, says to Zaheer-ud-Din Baber (founder of Mughal Empire) that you are lucky to stay in peaceful Kabul while, Delhi has been suffering from riots and depressions (Rekhta, 2022) (Asghar, 2019).

³⁴ Here, Iqbal in favor of rising Eastern nations. Iqbal argues that atheism has destroyed Europe while, revolutionary ideologies have been evolving in Eastern minds (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

³⁵ By preferring desert of Balochistan over Delhi and Bukhara, Iqbal advises Baloch people to be united for availing sustainable socio-economic growth and political stability (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

³⁶ Interpretation of this poem has controversial views where some consider it as a supportive poetry of Marxist literature while others find it as anti-Marxism. For pro-Marxism scholars, this poem criticizes capitalism as the trick to monopolize global economy while, capitalist usually use religion as a source to defend their interests (Islamabad-Post, 2022). On the other hand, anti-Marxist scholars take this poem as criticism on Karl Marx where second stanza shows Iqbal’s anti-Marx views as “O intelligent economist, what is in your books? Just the twisted lines and statements for encouraging labor force” (Rekhta, 2022) (Asghar, 2019).

³⁷ It was a motivational poem where Iqbal admires Napoleon as a courageous and motivational soldier; makes his resemblance with Amir Timur of Uzbekistan (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

³⁸ Although, some scholars argue that Iqbal denounce Mussolini but this poem along with Iqbal’s visit to Italy after 3rd Roundtable Conference in London (on an invitation of Mussolini) shows that Iqbal has idealize Mussolini’s acts and governance as a revolutionary leader and a savior of the nation (Rekhta, 2022) (Asim M. , 2020).

³⁹ Here, Iqbal is close to socialist scholars to count Iqbal as the admirer of Lenin and Marxism-Leninism. Similarly, some of scholars assume Iqbal as the supporter of Islamic socialism just of conversation between Lenin and God presented in this poem (Rekhta, 2022) (Asghar, 2019).

- 3) "Nawa-e-Mazdoor"⁴⁰, "Qismat Nama Sarmayadar wa Mazdoor"⁴¹, "Jamiat-ul-Aqwaam", "Jamhoriyat"⁴² and "Taseen Zartasht Azmaesh Kardan Aharman Zartasht ra"⁴³ in Peyam-e-Mashriq
- 4) "Arz-e-Mulk Khuda ast" "Ishtarak-o-Malookiyat"⁴⁴ in Javed Nama
- 5) "Mehnat-o-Sarmaya Dunya main Saf-aara ho gae"⁴⁵ "Membri Imperial Council ki Mushkil to nhi"⁴⁶ and "Mashriq main Asool Deen Ban Jate Hain"⁴⁷ in Bang-e-Dara

This analysis shows that Allama Iqbal was believed upon reconcilements whether this reconciliation was related to any theological, regional or socio-political study. And, his respective approach urges this study to find his position in between Inclusivism and Accomodativism.

Allama Iqbal in between Inclusivism and Accomodativism

As Inclusivism is sometimes refers as religious pluralism. It has further two schools of thought where traditional inclusivists argue that "believer's own beliefs are true within his own defined methodology. Similarly, other believers have their own validity for their beliefs and traditions". On the other hand, relative inclusivists say that "no one human being can claim to be live in absolute truth but everyone trace partially (or confused in between his) absolute truths".

Similarly, according to Bahai Faith (one of the Iranian religions);

"The fundamental principle enunciated by Bahá'u'lláh, the followers of His Faith firmly believe, is that religious truth is not absolute but relative, that Divine Revelation is a continuous and progressive

⁴⁰ "Nawa-e-Mazdoor" exhibits differences between rich and poor class within the context of communism and capitalism. As he also discourages role of Church/religion in strengthening such differences, several scholars take this poem as the Iqbal's support for Marxism and his Dialectical Materialism (Rekhta, 2022) (Asghar, 2019).

⁴¹ The words of this piece of poetry also discourage religious exploitation of poor class when Capitalists promotes religiosity just for the sake of fulfilling his material interests. Iqbal says that capitalists always seek all the joys and facilities for their selves while, they urge labor or poor class to be suffer from difficulties as per the will/wish of God (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁴² Unlike favoring western style of democracy, Iqbal favors intellectual(s) rule as the best form of governance (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁴³ Numerous scholars including John Hinnells (author of The "Penguin Dictionary of Religions", 1984) trace his poetry as an effort to reconciliation between Islam and Zoroastrianism. Moreover, they believe that Iqbal assume Ashu Zarathushtra or Zoroaster as one of the prophets that was sent by the God in Iranian soil (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁴⁴ In between Socialism and Capitalism, Iqbal says that socialism seeks revolution while, capitalism depends upon taxes. However, a common man is suppressing between both ideologies. This is because, both ideologies seek materialistic developments. In fact, by this poem, anti-Marxism scholars claim that Iqbal criticizes Karl Marx as falsified prophet (Rekhta, 2022) (Asghar, 2019).

⁴⁵ This composition words is about rivalry between Communism and Capitalism where Iqbal says, "I do not know which side will be victorious. However, there will be bloodshed from both sides. O Muslims, see what Quran says, he will be slipped if he will not follow Quranic principles" (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁴⁶ These poetic words exhibit his materialistic thoughts where he says (with referring Mirza Ghalib) that "I can take the membership of Imperial Council, I can take votes, but whether it will financially assist me?" Ghalib said very well that "to live in Delhi (capital of the India) can be a social standard/status, but from where I have to eat?" (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁴⁷ He argues, "Scientific laws in the East are considered as the part of religion, but they are used to industrial revolution in the West. Here, so-called correlation between scientific laws and socio-religious dogmatism does not leave any penny in our pocket, but West earns three from one" (Rekhta, 2022) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

process, that all the great religions of the world are divine in origin, that their basic principles are in complete harmony, that their aims and purposes are one and the same, that their teachings are but facets of one truth, that their functions are complementary, that they differ only in the nonessential aspects of their doctrines, and that their missions represent successive stages in the spiritual evolution of human society” (Bahauallah, 1947).

Similarly, in Christianity, there is a belief (presented in Titus 2:11) that “The grace of God that brings salvation has appeared to all men” (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

A popular Rig Vedic hymn extracting from Hinduism argue that “Truth is One, though the sages know it variously”. Thus, this statement also proclaims a pluralistic view of religion (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

Therefore, Inclusivism generally defines as particular form of religious pluralism where all beliefs have equal weightage within the specific context of believer (Banerjee, 1998, p. xxi).

On the other hand, the term “Accomodativism” generally means appropriateness, conformances and reconcilements. In contrary, the term “Accomodationism” means to accommodate distinct religious identities by government in a structural framework with regard to providing fundamental human rights, religious expressions and particular facilities⁴⁸ (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

Hence, by examining Iqbal’s socio-political and theological adjustments within the perspective of Inclusivism and Accomodativism or Accomodationism, this study looks Iqbal as an inclusively accommodative personality. He tried not only to reconcile his religious thoughts with other religions⁴⁹ but to avail regional associations⁵⁰ and ideological affiliations with Marxism⁵¹. And, his this approach assists the study to formulate a concrete definition of “Inclusive Accomodativism” that can be applied in any multicultural, multi-ethnic society, state or region for cultural, economic, political, religious and social adjustments regarding ensuring 3Ps (peace, progress and prosperity), structural functionalism and cosmopolitanism (Zaheer & Asim, 2022).

So, “Inclusive Accomodativism can be decoded as seeking similar traits between socio-political and/or cultural segments, market economies and religious/sectarian factions by avoiding differences (even major or minor) just to avail 3Ps⁵² (peace, progress and prosperity), structural functionalism and cosmopolitanism” (Zaheer & Asim, 2022).

⁴⁸ This term have been introduced in the George Washington’s letter to “Religious Society of Friends”, and in the writings of Mark Noll, Alexis de Tocqueville and Richard John Neuhaus (Nussbaum, 2013, p. 76).

⁴⁹ Especially with Buddhism, Hinduism and Zoroastrianism (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁵⁰ particularly with Germany, Italy, Russia or Soviet Union, Afghanistan, Iran, Iraq, Saudi Arabia, Turkey along with geographical demarcations of Kashmir and Badakhshan Mountain Range (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁵¹ Within the context of Socialism, Communism or particularly Leninism or Islamic Socialism (Asghar, 2019).

⁵² The term “3Ps” has been proposed and prefaced by Dr. Muhammad Asim at the time of establishing the virtual phase of Pak-Iran Intellectuals Forum as a think tank that aim is to promote peace, progress and prosperity in Pak-Iran region and around (Home Page, 2018).

On the other hand, the term “Inclusive Accomodationism” particularly uses within the context of ensuring peaceful reconcilements only in the theo-dominant or multi-religions societies⁵³ by tracing similarities, likenesses and connections between one another (Zaheer & Asim, 2022).

As Iqbal as an inclusive accommodative personality has been discussed at different forums, opinion pieces in distinct newspapers and blogs under a research project of Pak-Iran Intellectuals Forum⁵⁴, this study now applies “Inclusive Accomodativism” – as an extracted term from academic, literal and poetic work of Iqbal – on Afghanistan, Azerbaijan, Iran and Pakistan by considering numerous issues during 21st century.

Afghanistan

Implication of “Inclusive Accomodativism” on 21st century’s Afghanistan portrays certain suggestions as;

- Afghanistan is the homeland of numerous ethnic communities. Among linguistic and cultural fractions, there are Pashtun, Dari, Uzbek, Tajik, Turkmen, Baloch and Pamiri along with distinct other identities. Similarly, religiously, this is the land of Sunni Muslims, Shia Muslims, Ismaili Muslims, Sikhs, Hindus and Christians. The only way to ensure 3Ps (peace, progress and prosperity), structural functionalism and cosmopolitanism in Afghanistan is to construct such a political system via Loya Jirga and constitution that delivers equal socio-political and economic rights to all ethnic communities where they live (Mashal, 2022). However, political system must follow unitarism. This is because, federal structure always grows the seeds of ethno-national separatisms in a state where society is socio-cultural, religiously or political divided (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).
- By execution of the respective principles defined by Third Positionism, Afghanistan would be exhibited as inclusively accommodative country for all the ethnic segments (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).
- After August 15, 2021, analysts across the globe were predicting that the new interim setup of Afghanistan would be an example of peaceful co-existence among all the ethnic communities of Afghanistan, and they will be united after US withdrawal. However, major representation of Pashto speaking Sunni-Hanafi Muslims in new interim Afghan government is once again triggering anti-state sentiments among Uzbek, Tajik, Turkmen and some other ethnic identities. So, unlike Karzai and Ghani governments, second tenure of Afghan Taliban in Afghanistan is not able to ensure Iqbal’s expectation as “Afghan Baqi, Kohsar Baqi” but stimulating the differences more than before (Asghar, 2019) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁵³ The Term “Theo-dominant society” was taken from the M.Phil thesis of Dr. Syed Raheem Abbas Naqvi (Assistant Professor of Political Science at the Government Postgraduate College Bhakkar, Punjab) whose research was entitled as “Iranian Democracy; A Guideline for Theo-Dominant Societies” (Hussain Bukhari & Naqvi, 2015).

⁵⁴ This project also receives significant contribution from Kamran Zameer (lecturer of English literature at Government Associate College Dhoke Syedan, Rawalpindi), Tariq Saeed (Department of Logistics, ChangAn University Xian, China), Maryam Habib & Junaid Bangash (Research Associates at Fatema Jinnah Society for Women Development in Afghanistan, Iran and Pakistan, Qom, Iran), and Asia Karim (visiting lecturer of political science at Fatima Jinnah Women University Rawalpindi).

Azerbaijan

21st century's Azerbaijan is being examined as;

- Currently Azerbaijan has two ethno-linguistic issues. Firstly, Talysh ethnic community has once been registered at UNPO for availing Talysh-Mughan Autonomous Republic within the territorial jurisdiction of Azerbaijan or there should be a sovereign republic for Talysh people in southeast Azerbaijan (UNPO, 2022). Secondly, Armenian population of Nagorno-Karabakh desires either to join Armenia or seek sovereign Republic of Artsakh (Asim M. , 2020). Here, state and society has to experience Inclusive Accomodativism only by offering greater regional autonomy to both ethnic communities as President Ilham Aliyev once offered to the people and de facto government of Nagorno-Karabakh during peace dialogues. However, Armenian refusal at this offer led the Nagorno-Karabakh war 2020 that ended with the victory of Azerbaijan (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).
- On the other hand, rapid economic growth in Nakhchivan coerces analysts to assess the birth of new Azerbaijani nation in South Caucasus. However, systematic and structural working relationship between markets of mainland Azerbaijani and Nakhchivan can avoid any kind of separation, and it would facilitate the state and society to experience 3Ps, structural functionalism and cosmopolitanism (Bukhari, Asim, & Roofi, 2019).
- Religiously, Azerbaijan is considered as an enlightened and moderate country where foreign relations with Israel have been welcomed by local Muslim population. Therefore, study concludes that the respective approach for ensuring inclusive accomodationism in Azerbaijan can become also a source of promoting and strengthening inclusive Accomodativism that would further undermine all kinds of ethnic dilemmas (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

Iran

Although, a large group of scholars criticize post-1979 Iranian political system by blaming suppression of ethnic minorities, but this study interrogates findings and gives certain suggestions within the perspective of Third Positionism and Iqbal's Inclusive Accomodativism as;

- Linguistically, Iran is Persian dominant country. However, under articles 15, 16 and 19 of Iranian constitution, every linguistic community has right to study, publish and speak its mother/regional language. Similarly, articles 12 and 13 of the constitution provides religious rights to all the sects within the Islam and to Zoroastrians, Jews and Christians (Constitution of Iran, 1989). However, criticism is; Iranian constitution does not recognize Baha'i Faith, Babism, Yarsanism and Mandaism are the separate religions. Therefore, their followers face suppression under state patronage (Khezri, 2020).
- On the other hand, Iranian authorities claim that Iran is experiencing multiculturalism and cosmopolitanism while, state uses force – under article 14 of the constitution – against only those who have been involved in anti-state and anti-regime activities (Constitution of Iran, 1989).
- This time, when UNPO has registered movements for sovereign South Azerbaijan, Eastern Kurdistan, West Balochistan and Ahwaz; the ground realities are quite different than the anti-

regime Iranians are portraying (UNPO, 2022). Survey⁵⁵ in respective regions by the authors does not find any sign of ethno-national separatism or state discrimination but inclusive Accomodativism (Zaheer & Asim, 2022).

- Likewise, Iranian role in the Middle East (especially during US invasion of Iraq, emergence of ISIS, Syrian civil war, referendum in Iraqi Kurdistan, Saudi-led Yemen war, and revolution-oriented protests in Bahrain) urges several scholars to assume Iran as the “Geneva of the East”. However, their assumption is only because of either their pro-regime stance or their inspirations from Iranian capabilities and defensive arrangements against US-led or US-sponsored activities in the region (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

Pakistan

Like Afghanistan, Azerbaijan and Iran, Pakistan is also ethnically divided society. However, unlike them, Pakistan is a federal country where 18th amendment in the constitution of 1973 has been highly criticizing as the major source of leading the country towards facing the similar end as Yugoslavia (1945-1992) and Czechoslovakia (1990-1992) have experienced under federal state structure (Saeed & Asim, 2021). Thus, this study evaluates;

- Pakistan has experienced inclusive Accomodativism only under the 17th amendment in the constitution when state structure was experiencing tight federalism while, actual autonomy had been delivered to the district governments under Devolution of Power Plan. Moreover, non-party based local government system at district levels was urging each contesting group to add every lingual, socio-cultural and religious segment in the panel regarding contesting elections with the support of each community. This trend/rule promoted not only ethnic harmony but 3Ps in the country. At the same time, there was no difference in local government system in anyone among all the four provinces of Pakistan; therefore, provision of funds, delivery of economic rights and encouragement of developmental projects by the federal government have been observed universally in the whole country (Saeed & Asim, 2021).
- As 18th amendment is being criticized for triggering provincialism and linguisticism; a suggestion has been quoted at various forums that Pakistan should be a unitary or tight-federal state (with nominal provincial autonomy as under 17th amendment) where local government system (similar to the Devolution Plan of Musharraf) is the only solution not only to undermine ethno-national separatisms, provincialisms and linguisticisms, but to ensure and strengthen Inclusive Accomodativism (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).
- Another suggestion has also been given by some of worthy scholars that Pakistan needs new provinces on administrative bases where no one province should have dominance of any ethno-linguistic or ethno-cultural segments. At the same time, some of scholars desire to seek each division as a new province in Pakistan. However, study finds that whatever will be the strategy of forming new provinces but Inclusive Accomodativism in ethnically divided society like Pakistan can only be implemented when statehood will be the common practice of each socio-political and economic institution (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

⁵⁵ Surveys were conducted personally by the authors in the cities of Mahabad, Ilam, Tabriz, Urmia, Khoy, Zahedan, Bam and Ahwaz during October-November 2016 and November-December 2019.

- At western academic forums, it has been highly discussed that Pakistan is suffering from extremist dogmatism where accusation of blasphemy has become a common practice. Killing of Governor Punjab Salman Taseer and Sri Lankan citizen Priyantha Kumara are some of its major examples that highlight absence of Inclusive Accommodationism in the state. Similarly, some of sectarian clashes in Chillas (Gilgit-Baltistan), Dera Ismail Khan and Para Chinar (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa), Quetta (Balochistan), Bhakkar and Jhang (Punjab) are the indication for the federal and provincial governments to look this matter seriously, and strictly ensure religious harmony under the principles of “Live and Let Live” or Quranic verse “For you is your religion, and for me is my religion” (Kafirun: 06) (Bangash, Saeed, & Asim, 2022).

Conclusion

Examination of Iqbal’s poetry even generates two contrary schools in between his each stance on any socio-political, regional or theological discussion; however, core of his poetry has been found as “Muslims across the globe” and “Strictly Centralized Globalization within the context of Islam” as describe in his poem “Hindustani Bachon ka Geet” in the book Bang-e-Dara. However, his inclusive approach towards other socio-political, regional and theological ideologies regarding seeking reconcilements make him inclusively accommodative personality who always tries to adjust himself in each school of thought by protecting his personal believes. Therefore, his respective attitude helps the study to formulate the term “Inclusive Accomodativism” (where Inclusive Accomodationism has been proved as one of its parts). Moreover, Iqbal was also aware of his this ability. Therefore, he says that;

اقبال بڑا اُپدیشک ہے، من باتوں میں موہ لیتا ہے
گفتار کا یہ غازی تو بنا، کردار کا غازی بن نہ سکا

(Iqbal is very much talkative, attract others with his conversations. He learnt the tactic of discussions but he could not polish his character.)

Likewise, a stanza of Saif-ud-Din Saif looks fit on Iqbal’s position in between Eastern and Western socio-political, regional and theological ideologies as;

سیف، اندازِ بیاں بات بدل دیتا ہے
ورنہ دنیا میں کوئی بات نئی بات نہیں

(O Saif, conversation style changes the meaning. Otherwise, nothing is new in this world)

Thus, study concludes that Iqbal’s Inclusive Accomodativism provides a new theoretical perspective to social sciences academia regarding investigating socio-political, regional and theological issues, and gives a way to promote 3Ps (peace, progress and prosperity), structural functionalism and cosmopolitanism in any state, society or region having complex diversities.

References

Asghar, D. G. (2019). Ideology of Allama Iqbal about Statehood and Nationalism. Bahawalpur, Punjab, Pakistan: Department of Urdu and Iqbaliyat at the Islamia University of Bahawalpur.

- Asim, M. (2020, July 23). *Political Economy of Ethno-National Movements in the Post-Soviet Eurasian Region and Its Impact on Iranian Azerbaijan Region*. Bahawalpur, Punjab, Pakistan: Department of Political Science in the Islamia University of Bahawalpur.
- Bahauallah. (1947). *The Faith of Bahá'u'lláh: A World Religion*. (Bahá'í International Community Palestine) Retrieved from Bahá'í International Community: <https://web.archive.org/web/20050227024312/http://www.bic-un.bahai.org/47-0701.htm>
- Banerjee, K. M. (1998). *From Exclusivism to Inclusivism: The Theological Writings of Krishna Mohun Banerjee (1813-1885)*. Delhi: Indian Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge.
- Bangash, J., Saeed, T., & Asim, M. (2022, January 15). Discussion on Iqbal in between Eastern and Western Ideologies. Islamabad, Pakistan: Pak-Iran Intellectuals Forum (Islamabad Office).
- Bukhari, M. H., Asim, M., & Roofi, Y. (2019). Ethnic Dilemma in Iranian Azerbaijan during Post-Soviet Era: Impacts on Multilateral Trade under ECO. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, 239-252.
- Constitution of Iran*. (1989). Tehran: Assembly of Experts for Constitution.
- Eveleth, R. (2019, April 18). *When Futurism Led to Fascism—and Why It Could Happen Again*. Retrieved from WIRED: <https://www.wired.com/story/italy-futurist-movement-techno-utopians/>
- Habib, M., Saeed, T., & Asim, M. (2022). Ensuring Peaceful Coexistence and Religious Harmony by Intellectual Debates; A Comparative Study of Philosophical Roots belongs to Menander, Nagasena, Iqbal and Ali Shariati. *International Conference and Art Festival for Promoting Social Cohesion and Interfaith Harmony*. Islamabad: Silk Road Center.
- Hashmi, D. (2015, November 09). *Footprints: Finding Iqbal in Germany*. Retrieved from Daily DAWN: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1218406>
- Home Page*. (2018, April 01). Retrieved from Pak-Iran Intellectuals Forum: <https://pakiranintellectualsforum.wordpress.com/>
- Hussain Bukhari, M., & Naqvi, S. R. (2015). *Iranian Democracy; a Guideline for Theo-Dominant Society*. Bahawalpur: Department of Political Science at the Islamia University of Bahawalpur.
- Khezri, H. (2020, February 24). *Iran's ongoing war against its religious minorities*. Retrieved from Open Democracy: <https://www.opendemocracy.net/en/north-africa-west-asia/irans-ongoing-war-against-its-religious-minorities/>
- Mashal, M. (2022, February 03). Informal Justice System: Challenges to its Institutionalization in Afghanistan (2001-2015). Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan: Area Study Center for China, Russia and Central Asia in the University of Peshawar.
- Merkel, P. H. (2014). *Nature and Nationalism: Right-Wing Ecology and the Politics of Identity in Contemporary Germany*. London: Cambridge University Press.
- Nussbaum, M. C. (2013). *The New Religious Intolerance: Overcoming the Politics of Fear in an Anxious Age*. London: Harvard University Press.

- Rekhta. (2022). *Allama Iqbal*. Retrieved February 15, 2022, from Rekhta:
<https://www.rekhta.org/poets/allama-iqbal/all>
- Roofi, Y., & Asim, M. (2017). Ethnic Dilemma in badakhshan Region: Implication on Pamiri Ethnic Community in Pakistan. *Grassroots*, 331-344.
- Saeed, T., & Asim, M. (2021). Governance and Decentralization within Federalism and Unitarism; A Comparative Study of Pakistan and Iran from Third Positionists' Perceptive. *Conference on Democratic Federalism, Governance and Decentralization*. Khairpur Mirs: Department of Political Science at the Shah Abdul Latif University Khairpur.
- UNPO. (2022, February 14). *UNPO Members*. Retrieved from Unrepresented Nations and Peoples Organization (UNPO): <https://unpo.org/nations-peoples>
- Zaheer, A., Roofi, Y., & Asim, M. (2020). Constitutional Economics under an Official Thought to be Divinely Guided: Implication on Islamic Republic of Iran. *Journal of Islamic Thought and Civilization*, 273-287.
- Zaheer, D. M., & Asim, D. (2022, January 17). Iqbal as an Inclusively Accomodative Personality. Islamabad, Pakistan: Pak-Iran Intellectuals Forum.